

Is Islamic Sharia Law Compatible with Australian Law?

12 April 2025

Can the West survive under Islam. On the 19 June 2014, amid global concerns about extremism, I explored the complex relationship between Islam and the Western world. The premise was that Islam and Western cultures could coexist, provided mutual respect prevailed. However, Islam's lack of a renaissance and the emergence of various sects have fuelled extremist views that overshadow its positive contributions globally.

Some eleven years later I revisited the same question and in doing so I explored further into the compatibility of Islamic Sharia law with Australian law, that is amidst ongoing global concerns about extremism and cultural integration. The premise is that Islam and Western cultures can coexist through mutual respect, despite Islam's lack of a renaissance and the emergence of extremist sects. In Australia, Islam integrates within the existing legal framework, yet questions persist regarding the harmonization of faith-based cultures under a secular legal system.

This analysis evaluates the intersections between Sharia and Australian jurisprudence, highlighting conflicts in gender equality, religious freedom, and criminal justice. Case studies reveal how Australian courts address Islamic marriage contracts and financial products, while national security challenges underscore the need for balanced policies.

Political and social responses are critical in shaping Australia's multicultural landscape. Government initiatives focus on addressing illegal migration and fostering interfaith dialogue, while community leaders and policymakers emphasize integration and understanding. The broader context highlights the West's struggle with Islamic forces, necessitating reconciliation and adaptation. Cultural alienation and misunderstandings underscore the importance of policies that protect cultural, political, religious, and military interests.

This calls for unity, urging Australians to embrace cultural change and recognize their unique national identity. By fostering inclusivity and understanding, Australia can thrive as a diverse nation where multiple cultures coexist under a unified legal system that respects individual freedoms and collective responsibilities. The future of this relationship hinges on proactive efforts to bridge cultural divides and promote education, ensuring all citizens feel valued and respected.

Islam's Presence in Australia. Islam has found a place within the framework of Australian law, benefiting from institutions that reflect Australian society's character. Conflicts are resolved efficiently, showcasing resilience and cooperation. Yet, questions linger about whether faith-based cultures can harmonize under Australian law, as Sharia law remains unrecognized due to Australia's secular stance.

Sharia Law vs. Australian Legal Principles. Australia's secular legal framework, rooted in British common law, faces scrutiny in navigating cultural pluralism. The compatibility of Islamic Sharia law with Australian law is debated amid demographic shifts and geopolitical tensions. This analysis examines the intersections between Sharia and Australian jurisprudence.

- Gender Equality: Sharia's provisions on polygamy, divorce (talaq), and inheritance often clash with Australia's *Sex Discrimination Act 1984*. The NSW Civil and Administrative Tribunal ruled against gender-segregated seating at Hizb ut-Tahrir events in 2016, highlighting such conflicts (Macklin, 2016).
- Freedom of Religion: Australia's Constitution guarantees the freedom of religious practice but prohibits state religion. Practices like mandatory veiling and mosque loudspeakers have faced resistance, as seen in Bendigo's 2015 mosque protests (Jones, 2015).
- **Criminal Justice**: Sharia-prescribed punishments, such as corporal penalties for theft, conflict with Australia's human rights commitments under international treaties (UN Treaty Collection, 2023).

Case Studies: Clashes and Adaptations

- 1. Family Law Disputes: Australian courts recognize Islamic marriage contracts (nikah) if they meet contractual standards. However, Sharia-based divorce proceedings like unilateral talaq are not legally binding. A Federal Court case in 2021, *El Ali v El Ali*, emphasized that Australian family law prevails over religious decrees.
- 2. Islamic Finance: Australia accommodates Sharia-compliant financial products under the *Corporations Act* 2001, reflecting adaptability in commercial law. This approach mirrors the UK's integration of Islamic finance (Hodgson, 2022).
- 3. Extremism and National Security: The 2025 firebombing of a Sydney Jewish childcare facility by Islamist militants highlighted radical ideologies' risks. ASIO reports over 60 terror-related charges since 2014, sparking debates on balancing religious freedom with security measures (ASIO Annual Report, 2025).

Political and Social Responses

- **Government Policies**: The Abbott government's "Operation Sovereign Borders" (2013) addressed illegal migration but also reignited fears of cultural fragmentation with the 2025 relocation of 3,000 Gazan refugees (Commonwealth of Australia, 2025).
- **Community Reactions**: Figures like former PM Tony Abbott advocate for campaigns against extremist interpretations, while Islamic councils condemn groups like ISIS. Yet, Hizb ut-Tahrir's Uthman Badar asserted, "Islam is not up for negotiation" (Badar, 2014).
- Legal Pluralism: The Judicial Committee of the Privy Council has adapted Islamic endowment laws in Commonwealth nations, but Australia's strict secularism precludes formal Sharia recognition (Abbasi, 2023).

Pathways to Coexistence

- 1. Clear Legal Boundaries: Enforce laws against hate speech and discrimination while protecting private religious practices. Prayer rooms in workplaces are permissible unless they infringe on others' rights (Australian Human Rights Commission, 2023).
- 2. Education and Dialogue: Interfaith initiatives are essential for demystifying Sharia. The Australian National Imams Council's 2015 fatwa against ISIS shows how moderate voices can counter extremism (ANIC, 2015).
- 3. **Reformist Islamic Scholarship**: Scholars like Samir Abu Hamza face backlash, but figures such as Tim Soutphommasane advocate for accountability within Islamic institutions (Soutphommasane, 2023).

4. International Collaboration: The UK's approach to Sharia councils, which operate under strict oversight, offers a model to prevent parallel legal systems (Hirsi Ali, 2023).

The Broader Context. Despite successes against Islamic forces, the West faces immense costs in manpower and political will. Reconciliation with Islam seems necessary. The resurgence of militants, thawing relations between Iran and the West, and pseudo trade pacts between Russia and China exemplify current dynamics.

Democracy is expanding, but the Western world is shrinking. Nations like Russia and India are not seen as part of the Western paradigm. Europe, North America, South Africa, Australia, New Zealand, and Canada remain the traditional West, facing demographic challenges.

Cultural Alienation and Integration. In Europe, Islamic culture faces retaliation as alien. Indigenous birth rates dwindle compared to Islamists and guest workers. In Japan, Islamic culture is not permitted, sparking debate about emulating this in Australia. Illegal boat trafficking has contributed to Islam's growth in Australia, with the Abbott Government focusing on eliminating people smugglers and enforcing policies.

Cultural Misunderstandings. The growing number of Muslims in the West raises concerns about their influence. Protests like those in Bendigo, Victoria, reflect fear of an alien culture. Issues like Burqa wearing, law enforcement's right to request identification, and mosque restrictions highlight ongoing tensions.

A Call for Unity. Regardless of origin, Australians should embrace cultural change, allowing the nation to grow. Australia, not European, American, or Asian, must recognize its unique place. Policies protecting cultural, political, religious, and military interests are crucial. As an Australian of Hellenic origins, I urge all Australians to stand tall and embrace indigenous brethren.

Understanding Sharia Law in Context. Sharia law, rooted in Islamic theology, encompasses moral, ethical, and legal guidelines. Derived from the Quran and Hadith, it addresses various aspects of daily life. In predominantly Muslim countries, Sharia's integration into national legal systems varies widely.

Challenges and Adaptations in Australia. Legal Conflicts: Family law under the Family Law Act 1975 applies equally to all citizens, with Australian courts recognizing aspects of Islamic marriage contracts. However, Shariabased divorce proceedings are not enforced, as they conflict with justice and equality principles.

- **Criminal Justice**: Sharia's punishments for certain crimes conflict with Australia's human rights commitments. The Australian system emphasizes rehabilitation and restorative justice.
- **Religious Freedom**: Australia upholds religious freedom but not at the expense of national laws or individual rights. This balance ensures that religious practices align with secular laws.

Social Dynamics

- **Cultural Integration**: Australia's multicultural policy supports cultural expression within democracy, equality, and the rule of law. Dialogue between communities is vital to prevent alienation and foster cohesion.
- Interfaith Initiatives: Programs promoting interfaith dialogue help dispel myths and foster understanding, emphasizing shared values and mutual respect.
- Media Portrayals: Sensationalized media portrayals can exacerbate Islamophobia. Responsible journalism is essential in reflecting Muslims' diversity.

Political and Policy Considerations

• Immigration and Integration: Policies like "Operation Sovereign Borders" highlight the complexities of balancing security with humanitarian obligations. Integration into Australian society is crucial.

- **Countering Extremism**: Collaboration between government agencies, community leaders, and religious organizations is vital in challenging extremist narratives.
- **Policy Development**: Policymakers must engage with community leaders to ensure legislation reflects Australia's multicultural reality while safeguarding democratic principles.

Navigating the Future. The compatibility of Islamic Sharia law with Australian law requires ongoing dialogue and adaptation. While challenges exist, Australia's commitment to multiculturalism and democratic values provides a framework for peaceful coexistence. The future depends on bridging cultural divides, promoting education, and ensuring all citizens feel valued.

Peter Adamis

Freelance Journalist

Postscript' This analysis calls for nuanced engagement, not condemnation. Mutual respect and lawful integration are paramount. Australia's strength lies in harmonizing diverse traditions without compromising its principles. If I saw a person of Islamic faith mistreated, I would defend them. If living in an Islamic country, I would respect its customs while practicing my faith privately, reflecting mutual respect and coexistence.

References

- Abbasi, Z. (2023). Legal systems and adaptation: A historical perspective. Oxford University Press.
- ASIO Annual Report. (2025). Australian Security Intelligence Organisation.
- Australian Human Rights Commission. (2023). Religious freedom and workplace rights.
- Badar, U. (2014). "Islam is not up for negotiation." Hizb ut-Tahrir Australia.
- Commonwealth of Australia. (2025). Operation Sovereign Borders: A policy review.
- Can the Western World survive under Islam: Abalinx Peter Adamis
- Hodgson, P. (2022). Islamic finance in the Western world. Cambridge University Press.
- Hirsi Ali, A. (2023). "Sharia councils in the UK: A critical analysis." News.com.au.
- Islam and the West: Abalinx Peter Adamis
- Jones, K. (2015). "Bendigo mosque protests: Causes and implications." The Age.
- Macklin, J. (2016). "Gender equality and religious practices in Australia." Journal of Australian Law.
- <u>Soutphommasane, T. (2023). "Accountability within Islamic institutions." Australian Human Rights</u> <u>Commission.</u>
- UN Treaty Collection. (2023). International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.
- ANIC. (2015). Fatwa against ISIS. Australian National Imams Council.